

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Thursday, 16 August 2012 6:26 PM
To: publicsubmissions
Subject: Shenton Park Substation proposal

Hello:

I am a resident of Nash Street in Daglish and I participated in the 'community consultations' conducted at the Nedlands bowling club by Western Power. I found it troubling that so few local residents were invited to these sessions. Only the residents of Lonnie Street and the residents on the south side of Nash Street were invited to these consultations. Overall, I felt the overall was a farce and the feedback from the community members who did attend these sessions were dismissed by the Western Power staff as simply 'it will cost too much' or 'the regulator won't approve it' without any further explanation as to why either of these statements would be the case.

The community made a number of suggestions, that I feel were extremely valid to the discussion, but were never addressed:

- Preservation or replacement of native trees. This request was made widely and unanimously by Western Power, who only came back with designs including grass, and a few shrubs. The trees on the site are a significant habitat for Barnaby's Black Cockatoo. Nothing was done by Western Power to address these requests;
- The residents requested that the site be lowered in order to minimize the negative visual impact. This was not considered, and the cost analysis for doing, which was also requested, was never done;
- The residents requested that the existing site be expanded with three new transformer units instead of two. This was thought to increase redundancy, and reduce load risk due to maintenance on any one device. In addition, the use of three units would allow Western Power to effectively stage the replacement of the older equipment in phases, and the smaller units would allow for the lowering of the site incrementally. Again, a cost benefit analysis was requested, and none was supplied. A reason for why the option was not considered was requested, but none was supplied. This was completely dismissive and lazy on the part of Western Power's technical staff;
- The residents requested that the option of putting the power lines underground be considered. This is extremely valid as the site is next to the new Autism Centre and the Daglish Fire Station. Again, Western Power did not consider this option, saying only that it was 'too expensive' - but never providing one shred of cost benefit analysis to prove this point;
- The residents requested that the option of distributing the base load amongst the existing facilities - such as Wembley and Hollywood be presented to them. The community felt that that these stations were still valuable and the option to put 'everything' into the Shenton Park site was unwarranted. It was telling that staff and members from the City of Nedlands attended to push the Shenton Park option. Obviously their constituents wanted the Hollywood site closed down. This was a farce.

In short, the technical staff of Western Power had already determined what they thought could 'pass' the ERA in terms of cost and the associated rate increase. The community consultation was simply a going through the motions, and none of the community's feedback was taken into account in the proposals currently in front of the ERA for the expansion of the Shenton Park Substation. So in terms of section 3.4 of the feedback form:

- The consultation with the community did not include the actual community of the Shenton Park substation. On the contrary, it included vested political interests, such as the City of Nedlands that

wanted to have power stations removed from their jurisdictions and therefore to thrust the problem on the citizens of Shenton Park and Dagsih; and

- The alternatives suggested by the community members in attendance were given no consideration whatsoever. Western Power's technical staff took the stance that it was a *fait accompli* and therefore the 'consultation' as such was only to give members of the community some information about what was going to happen, regardless.

I think that a further review is merited and that the ERA should not approve this plan at this stage. More work is necessary, a plan can be made workable, but at present Western Power has not earned a passing grade. Thank you.

All the best,

A black rectangular redaction box covering the signature area.